

More "Rigorous" Standards Do Not Correlate with Student Achievement.

Compiled by Dan Guernsey, NAPCIS
10/28/13

A 2012 study by Tom Loveless reveals that the quality of state standards, as indicated by the well-known ratings from the Fordham Foundation, are not related to achievement.

(http://www.brookings.edu/~media/research/files/reports/2012/2/brown%20center/0216_brown_education_loveless.pdf)

Nevertheless states and schools continue to argue for Common Core adoption based on the idea that Fordham has identified the Common Core Standards as being more rigorous than English (ELA) standards in 37 states and math standards in 39 states in its document *The State of State Standards*.

(<http://www.edexcellence.net/publications/the-state-of-state-of-standards-and-the-common-core-in-2010.html>.)

The Fordham Foundation gave the Common Core an A- rating in both English Language Arts and Math. It then gave a grade to each state's English and Math standards. Comparing Fordham's letter grade which claims to reflect the quality of each state's standards to the state's actual performance on national tests not only reflects Loveless' point, but reveals a level of disconnect between the Fordham Institute grades and real world results that merits careful consideration of its implications and of the value of the Common Core Standards themselves.

The list below ranks schools by their 2011 NAEP 4th grade scores in Math and English.

There were six states that scored 244 on the NAEP Math test. Yet of these schools: one had a Fordham standards rating of A, three had a ranking of C and 2 had a ranking of F. Same performance vastly different standards rankings.

Consider the top 10 and bottom 10 on the lists:

TOP 10 English NAEP Ave: 229	Fordham Standards Analysis GPA 1.90 (D+)
BOTTOM 10 English NAEP Ave: 211	Fordham Standards Analysis GPA 2.36 (C+)
TOP 10 Math NAEP Ave: 248	Fordham Standards Analysis GPA 1.36 (D)
BOTTOM 10 Math NAEP Ave: 233	Fordham Standards Analysis GPA 2.02 (C-)

The lower NAEP scores have a higher letter Fordham letter grade analysis of their state standards than the higher performing schools

Another way of unpacking this is to consider that the five Fordham "A" state's English scores and scores for the five "F" state's English scores both average and NAEP score of 220.

The Math scores of the six states with Fordham "A" standards have an NAEP Math average of 240, the seven states with Fordham "F" standards have a higher average of 245.

NAEP Score 4th Grade 2011	Rank by English	English Standards Grade
Massachusetts	237	A-
Maryland	231	C
New Jersey	231	C
New Hampshire	230	C
Connecticut	227	D
Pennsylvania	227	D
Vermont	227	D
North Dakota	226	D
Virginia	226	B+
Delaware	225	F
Florida	225	B
Kentucky	225	D
Montana	225	F
Kansas	224	C
Ohio	224	C
Wyoming	224	D
Colorado	223	B+
Nebraska	223	F
Maine	222	C
Minnesota	222	C
New York	222	C
Rhode Island	222	D
Georgia	221	B+
Ohio	221	C
Indiana	221	A
Iowa	221	F
North Carolina	221	D
Washington	221	C
Wisconsin	221	D
Alabama	220	B
Missouri	220	D
South Dakota	220	C
Utah	220	C
Illinois	219	D
Michigan	219	D
Texas	218	A-
Arkansas	217	D
Oregon	216	C
Oklahoma	215	B+
South Carolina	215	D
Tennessee	215	A-

NAEP Score 4th Grade 2011	Rank By Math	Math Standards Grade
Massachusetts	253	B+
New Hampshire	252	D
Minnesota	249	B+
New Jersey	248	C
Maryland	247	D
Vermont	247	F
Kansas	246	F
Pennsylvania	246	F
North Carolina	245	D
North Dakota	245	C
Virginia	245	C
Wisconsin	245	F
Colorado	244	C
Indiana	244	A
Maine	244	C
Montana	244	F
Ohio	244	C
Wyoming	244	F
Iowa	243	C
Utah	243	A-
Washington	243	A
Connecticut	242	D
Rhode Island	242	D
Kentucky	241	D
South Dakota	241	C
Texas	241	C
Delaware	240	B+
Florida	240	A
Idaho	240	B+
Missouri	240	D
Nebraska	240	C
Hawaii	239	C
Illinois	239	D
New York	239	B+
Arkansas	238	C
Georgia	238	A-
Nevada	237	C
Oklahoma	237	B+
Oregon	237	B+
south Carolina	237	C
Alaska	236	D

Hawaii	214	C
West Virginia	214	D
Ne3vada	213	C
Arizona	212	B
California	211	A
Louisiana	210	B+
Mississippi	209	D
Alaska	208	F
New Mexico	208	C

Michigan	236	A-
Arizona	235	B+
West Virginia	235	B+
California	234	A
New Mexico	233	C
Tennessee	233	C
Alabama	231	B+
Louisiana	231	C
Mississippi	230	C

Comparison A vs. F **English** Standards Schools

Comparison A vs. F **Math** Standards Schools

	NAEP English	Fordham Grade
California	211	A
Indiana	221	A
Massachusetts	237	A-
Tennessee	215	A-
Texas	218	A-
Total	1102	
Ave. A State NAEP	220	

	NAEP Math	Fordham Grade
California	234	A
Florida	240	A
Indiana	244	A
Washington	243	A
Georgia	238	A-
Michigan	236	A-
Utah	243	A-
Total	1678	
Ave. A State NAEP	240	

Alaska	208	F
Delaware	225	F
Iowa	221	F
Montana	225	F
Nebraska	223	F
Total	1102	
Ave. F State NAEP	220	

Kansas	246	F
Montana	244	F
Pennsylvania	246	F
Vermont	247	F
Wisconsin	245	F
Wyoming	244	F
Total	1472	
Ave. F State NAEP	245	

State	Fordham Science Grade	NAEP Science 8th Grade 2009
North Dakota	F	164
Montana	F	163
New Hampshire	D	162
South Dakota	F	162
Minnesota	C	161
Colorado	D	161

Massachusetts	A-	160
Maine	D	160
Idaho	F	159
Ohio	B	158
Utah	B	158
Wyoming	F	158
Wisconsin	F	158
Michigan	C	157
Iowa	D	157
Kentucky	D	157
Virginia	A-	156
Missouri	C	156
Connecticut	C	155
Washington	C	155
New Jersey	D	155
Oregon	F	155
D.C.	A	152
Indiana	A-	152
Maryland	B	152
Georgia	C	151
Pennsylvania	D	151
Texas	C	150
Delaware	C	150
New York	B+	149
Rhode Island	D	149
Arkansas	B	148
Florida	C	148
North Carolina	D	148
Tennessee	D	148
Oklahoma	F	148
Illinois	D	147
New Mexico	C	145
West Virginia	D	145
Arizona	D	144
Nevada	D	144
Louisiana	B	143
South Carolina	A-	142
Hawaii	D	142
California	A	140
Alabama	D	140
Mississippi	C	137

A State average = 150

F State Average =159