More "Rigorous" Standards Do Not Correlate with Student Achievement.

Compiled by Dan Guernsey, NAPCIS

10/28/13

A 2012 study by Tom Loveless reveals that the quality of state standards, as indicated by the well-known ratings from the Fordham Foundation, are not related to achievement.

(http://www.brookings.edu/~/media/research/files/reports/2012/2/brown%20center/0216\_brown\_education\_loveless.pdf )

Nevertheless states and schools continue to argue for Common Core adoption based on the idea that Fordham has identified the Common Core Standards as being more rigorous than English (ELA) standards in 37 states and math standards in 39 states in its document *The State of State Standards*. (http://www.edexcellence.net/publications/the-state-of-state-of-standards-and-the-common-core-in-2010.html.)

The Fordham Foundation gave the Common Core an A- rating in both English Language Arts and Math. It then gave a grade to each state's English and Math standards. Comparing Fordham’s letter grade which claims to reflect the quality of each state’s standards to the state’s actual performance on national tests not only reflects Loveless’ point, but reveals a level of disconnect between the Fordham Institute grades and real world results that merits careful consideration of its implications and of the value of the Common Core Standards themselves.

The list below ranks schools by their 2011 NAEP 4th grade scores in Math and English.

There were six states that scored 244 on the NAEP Math test. Yet of these schools: one had a Fordham standards rating of A, three had a ranking of C and 2 had a ranking of F. Same performance vastly different standards rankings.

Consider the top 10 and bottom 10 on the lists:

TOP 10 English NAEP Ave: 229 Fordham Standards Analysis GPA 1.90 (D+)

BOTTOM 10 English NAEP Ave: 211 Fordham Standards Analysis GPA 2.36 (C+ )

TOP 10 Math NAEP Ave: 248 Fordham Standards Analysis GPA 1.36 (D)

BOTTOM 10 Math NAEP Ave: 233 Fordham Standards Analysis GPA 2.02 (C-)

The lower NAEP scores have a higher letter Fordham letter grade analysis of their state standards than the higher performing schools

Another way of unpacking this is to consider that the five Fordham "A" state’s English scores and scores for the five "F" state’s English scores both average and NAEP score of 220.

The Math scores of the six states with Fordham "A" standards have an NAEP Math average of 240, the seven states with Fordham "F" standards have a higher average of 245.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| NAEP Score 4th Grade 2011 | Rank by **English** | **English** Standards Grade | |  | NAEP Score 4th Grade 2011 | Rank By **Math** | **Math** Standards Grade |
| Massachusetts | 237 | A- | |  | Massachusetts | 253 | B+ |
| Maryland | 231 | C | |  | New Hampshire | 252 | D |
| New Jersey | 231 | C | |  | Minnesota | 249 | B+ |
| New Hampshire | 230 | C | |  | New Jersey | 248 | C |
| Connecticut | 227 | D | |  | Maryland | 247 | D |
| Pennsylvania | 227 | D | |  | Vermont | 247 | F |
| Vermont | 227 | D | |  | Kansas | 246 | F |
| North Dakota | 226 | D | |  | Pennsylvania | 246 | F |
| Virginia | 226 | B+ | |  | North Carolina | 245 | D |
| Delaware | 225 | F | |  | North Dakota | 245 | C |
| Florida | 225 | B | |  | Virginia | 245 | C |
| Kentucky | 225 | D | |  | Wisconsin | 245 | F |
| Montana | 225 | F | |  | Colorado | 244 | C |
| Kansas | 224 | C | |  | Indiana | 244 | A |
| Ohio | 224 | C | |  | Maine | 244 | C |
| Wyoming | 224 | D | |  | Montana | 244 | F |
| Colorado | 223 | B+ | |  | Ohio | 244 | C |
| Nebraska | 223 | F | |  | Wyoming | 244 | F |
| Maine | 222 | C | |  | Iowa | 243 | C |
| Minnesota | 222 | C | |  | Utah | 243 | A- |
| New York | 222 | C | |  | Washington | 243 | A |
| Rhode Island | 222 | D | |  | Connecticut | 242 | D |
| Georgia | 221 | B+ | |  | Rhode Island | 242 | D |
| Ohio | 221 | C | |  | Kentucky | 241 | D |
| Indiana | 221 | A | |  | South Dakota | 241 | C |
| Iowa | 221 | F | |  | Texas | 241 | C |
| North Carolina | 221 | D | |  | Delaware | 240 | B+ |
| Washington | 221 | C | |  | Florida | 240 | A |
| Wisconsin | 221 | D | |  | Idaho | 240 | B+ |
| Alabama | 220 | B | |  | Missouri | 240 | D |
| Missouri | 220 | D | |  | Nebraska | 240 | C |
| South Dakota | 220 | C | |  | Hawaii | 239 | C |
| Utah | 220 | C | |  | Illinois | 239 | D |
| Illinois | 219 | D | |  | New York | 239 | B+ |
| Michigan | 219 | D | |  | Arkansas | 238 | C |
| Texas | 218 | A- | |  | Georgia | 238 | A- |
| Arkansas | 217 | D | |  | Nevada | 237 | C |
| Oregon | 216 | C | |  | Oklahoma | 237 | B+ |
| Oklahoma | 215 | B+ | |  | Oregon | 237 | B+ |
| South Carolina | 215 | D | |  | south Carolina | 237 | C |
| Tennessee | 215 | A- | |  | Alaska | 236 | D |
| Hawaii | 214 | C | |  | Michigan | 236 | A- |
| West Virginia | 214 | D | |  | Arizona | 235 | B+ |
| Ne3vada | 213 | C | |  | West Virginia | 235 | B+ |
| Arizona | 212 | B | |  | California | 234 | A |
| California | 211 | A | |  | New Mexico | 233 | C |
| Louisiana | 210 | B+ | |  | Tennessee | 233 | C |
| Mississippi | 209 | D | |  | Alabama | 231 | B+ |
| Alaska | 208 | F | |  | Louisiana | 231 | C |
| New Mexico | 208 | C | |  | Mississippi | 230 | C |
|  |  |  | |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  | |  |  |  |  |
| Comparison A vs. F | **English** Standards Schools | | |  | Comparison A vs. F | **Math** Standards Schools | |
|  |  | | |  |  |  | |
|  | NAEP English | | Fordham Grade |  |  | NAEP Math | Fordham Grade |
| California | 211 | | A |  | California | 234 | A |
| Indiana | 221 | | A |  | Florida | 240 | A |
| Massachusetts | 237 | | A- |  | Indiana | 244 | A |
| Tennessee | 215 | | A- |  | Washington | 243 | A |
| Texas | 218 | | A- |  | Georgia | 238 | A- |
| Total | 1102 | |  |  | Michigan | 236 | A- |
| Ave. **A** State NAEP | **220** | |  |  | Utah | 243 | A- |
|  |  | |  |  | Total | 1678 |  |
| Alaska | 208 | | F |  | Ave. **A** State NAEP | **240** |  |
| Delaware | 225 | | F |  |  |  |  |
| Iowa | 221 | | F |  | Kansas | 246 | F |
| Montana | 225 | | F |  | Montana | 244 | F |
| Nebraska | 223 | | F |  | Pennsylvania | 246 | F |
| Total | 1102 | |  |  | Vermont | 247 | F |
| Ave. **F** State NAEP | **220** | |  |  | Wisconsin | 245 | F |
|  |  | |  |  | Wyoming | 244 | F |
|  |  | |  |  | Total | 1472 |  |
|  |  | |  |  | Ave. **F** State NAEP | **245** |  |